

2 • EVALUATION OF THE 2002 HOUSING ELEMENT

Even though it was not certified, the City of Firebaugh has reviewed the 2002 Housing Element to evaluate the effectiveness of its goals, objectives, policies and 5-year action programs. Many of the goals, objectives, policies and programs contained in the 2008 Housing Element will be based on what was learned from the review of the 2002 Housing Element.

The 2002 Housing Element established a number of actions and programs designed to meet Firebaugh's housing needs. The City now has an opportunity to determine if these actions and programs were successful.

Goals, policies and action plans were contained in Chapter 7 of the 2002 Housing Element. A typical set of goals, policies and action plans are as follows:

GOAL: To manage housing and community development in a manner that will promote the long-term integrity and value of each new housing unit and the environment which it is located.

POLICY: Manage new residential development within the context of a planning framework designed to minimize adverse impacts on the area's natural resource base and overall living environment are minimized.

ACTION: Firebaugh will actively pursue annexation of reserve areas within the City's Sphere of Influence that are designated for residential development and are contiguous to existing urban development.

Year: Ongoing

Responsible Agency: City of Firebaugh, Planning Department

Funding: General Fund and annexation and environmental assessment fees

To determine the results of the 2002 Housing Element, interviews were conducted with City officials, development companies and housing agencies such as the Fresno County Housing Authority among others. Unfortunately, in some cases information from these sources was limited or not available.

It should be noted that some of the action plan programs were not directly the responsibility of the City of Firebaugh. In some cases financing from federal programs is specified for development of housing by private entities. Fresno County Housing Authority, which operates rental units and provides rental assistance for target households also plays an important role in the City's housing process. The City's responsibility typically rests in assisting other agencies whenever possible.

The 2002 Housing Element established housing production goals for the years 2002 - 2008 by income level and housing type. The State of California has established household income categories for all counties as follows:

<u>Income Category</u>	<u>Household Income limits</u>
“Very Low”	Earning less than 50 percent of the County median income
“Low”	Earning between 50 and 80 percent of County median income
“Moderate”	Earning between 80 and 120 percent of County median income
“Above-Moderate”	Earning above 120 percent of County median income

To arrive at actual income levels, the State determines the median income for all counties in California on an annual basis. Housing deemed "affordable" is generally considered to be housing that does not exceed 30% of the income of a household. As an example, for a household earning \$50,000 per year, affordable housing should cost no more than \$15,000 per year or \$1,250 per month.

The 2002 Firebaugh Housing Element established the following housing goals for income groups and housing types:

Table 2-1
2002 Housing Element Goals by Income and Unit Type

<u>Income Group</u>	<u>Units Needed</u>	<u>Single Family</u>	<u>Multiple Family</u>
Very Low	112 units	78 units	34 units
Other Low	79 units	55 units	24 units
Moderate	87 units	61 units	26 units
Above-Moderate	120 units	84 units	36 units
TOTAL	398 units	278 units	120 units
Actually Constructed	188 units	183 units	5 units

During the period July 2002 through July 2007, 188 residential units were constructed in Firebaugh – significantly short of the goal of 398 total units.

In terms of goals outlined in Table 2-1, above, Tables 2-2 and 2-3 below demonstrate the community's results:

Table 2-2
Housing Produced by Income Group

<u>Income Group</u>	<u>Target</u>	<u>Units Produced</u>	<u>Percent of Goal</u>
Very Low	112 units	51 units	46%
Other Low	79 units	45 units	57%
Moderate	87 units	47 units	54%
Above-Moderate	<u>120 units</u>	<u>45 units</u>	38%
TOTAL	398 units	188 units	

Table 2-3
Housing Produced by Unit Type

<u>Unit Type</u>	<u>Target</u>	<u>Units Produced</u>	<u>Percent of Goal</u>
Single Family Residential	278 units	183	66%
Multi-family Residential	120 units	5	4%
TOTAL	398 units	188 units	47%

The foregoing tables show that Firebaugh fell well short of meeting the housing production goals of the 2002 Housing Element – particularly with respect to multi-family housing.

There are likely a number of reasons that Firebaugh fell short of meeting its housing goals, including a lack of interested developers and the possibility that the housing projections of the 2002 Housing Element were too high. The city's population did not increase quite as much as was forecast in the 2002 Element. Also, no multi-family housing developers are known to have contacted the City during the planning period, expressing interest in development. However, the City currently has very little available vacant land zoned for multi-family development. This shortcoming will need to be addressed in the new Housing Element.

The City also fell short of its single family housing production goals. The 2002 Housing Element forecast a need for 278 units; only 183 units were constructed during the time period. However, since 2005 the City has approved 879 single family residential lots in three subdivisions, possibly reflecting a pent-up demand for housing. Reflecting the more recent downward spiral of the single family residential market, only one of these subdivisions has started construction as of the writing of this Element.

Evaluation of 2002 Housing Element Action Plans

Chapter 7 of the 2002 Housing Element contained action plans pertaining to eight topics:

1. Variety of Housing Types
2. Adequate Housing Location
3. Equal Access to Housing
4. Safe Housing
5. Long Term Integrity and Value of Housing
6. Affordable Housing
7. Adequate Regional Housing
8. Adequate Natural Resources

These Goals were further refined into Policies and Action Programs. An evaluation of each Action Program is contained in the following table

Table No. 2-4
Evaluation of 2002 Five-Year Action Plan

Goal 1: Variety of Housing Types

<u>Action</u>	<u>Year</u>	<u>Agency</u>	<u>Funding</u>	<u>Evaluation</u>
Action Program 1.1.1. By December 2005, the City will identify a special needs project and partner with a developer to accomplish it.	December, 2005	City of Firebaugh	Not identified	The City has partnered with the Greenlining Foundation and has approved construction of a 21-unit affordable condominium project (San Joaquin Villas) in 2006.
Action Program 1.2.1. Make application to the State of California to fund housing rehabilitation under the HCD	First quarter of 2005	City of Firebaugh	State Farm Worker Housing program funds	A lack of staff prevented completion of this program.

Firebaugh Housing Element 2008 – 2013
Chapter 2: Evaluation

<u>Action</u>	<u>Year</u>	<u>Agency</u>	<u>Funding</u>	<u>Evaluation</u>
Farm Worker Housing Program for renters and owners and home ownership utilizing Tax Increment as matching funds, at least every other year.				
Action Program 1.2.3. Review and update annually the public information summarizing the City's zone requirements, development fees, and permit procedures.	Third quarter of 2005	City of Firebaugh	General Fund	Partially completed. The City has completed a zoning standards matrix and fee matrix. Brochures summarizes permit procedures are currently under production

Goal 2: Adequate Housing Location

<u>Action</u>	<u>Year</u>	<u>Agency</u>	<u>Funding</u>	<u>Evaluation</u>
Action Plan 2.1.1. Firebaugh will prepare a five-year Land Use Plan update. This plan will set aside sufficient land area to meet future residential needs through 2008. Land reservation will be approximately 200 percent of need in order to allow sufficient land choice and inhibit inflated value due to potential monopoly of growth areas.	December 2006	City of Firebaugh	General Fund	A comprehensive update of the City's General Plan is currently under preparation and is expected to be completed by the end of 2008
Action Plan 2.1.2. Firebaugh will continue to update its AutoCAD digital database of zoning and parcels, to assist in locating appropriate sites for housing.	April 2005	City of Firebaugh	General Fund	Completed
Action Plan 2.1.3. By December 2005, the City will update government owned land inventory within the City and its "Sphere of Influence" and analyze for possible	December , 2005	City of Firebaugh	General Fund	An inventory of government-owned parcels has been completed, however none are suitable for housing

Firebaugh Housing Element 2008 – 2013
Chapter 2: Evaluation

<u>Action</u>	<u>Year</u>	<u>Agency</u>	<u>Funding</u>	<u>Evaluation</u>
housing sites. In 2005, the City will approach developers and funding agencies to facilitate development with assisted housing.				development.
Action Plan 2.1.4. Advocate for changes in Fresno LAFCo policies to permit annexation of properties in advance of specific development projects. The County of Fresno zones unincorporated land within the City's planned urban areas as Exclusive Agriculture and/or Limited Agriculture with a minimum parcel size of twenty acres. This action maintains the land in parcel sizes that can accommodate future urbanization, and precludes the development of uses that are incompatible with urban development.	June, 2005	City of Firebaugh	General Fund	The City has maintained an on-going working relationship with LAFCo and in 2006 completed a 212-acre annexation for residential development.
Action Plan 2.2.1. Encourage urban infill by providing a discounted fee structure and expedited processing of site plans. June 2005.	June, 2005	City of Firebaugh	Redevelopment Funds	A discounted fee structure has not yet been put in place. This goal has been added to the General Plan update nearing completion
Action Plan 2.2.2. Provide inducement for low and moderate-income inclusionary units by identifying adequate sites and providing developer incentives for lower priced rental housing. To enhance and extend this policy, the development of alternative and affordable housing types (i.e., manufactured housing, condos, mobile home subdivisions, zero lot line, etc.) shall be considered when evaluating new development proposals. This program shall be implemented in an ongoing manner as projects are submitted and as City officials	Ongoing	City of Firebaugh	General fund	The City provided financial assistance to the Greenlining Foundation's San Joaquin Villas project – a 21-unit affordable condominium project on Highway 33, north of Clyde Fannon Road. The City remains willing to work with developers on low- and moderate-income inclusionary units.

Firebaugh Housing Element 2008 – 2013
Chapter 2: Evaluation

Action	Year	Agency	Funding	Evaluation
meet with prospective developers. Strategies for implementing this program could include extending Redevelopment Agency financial incentives. The City will also prepare a map identifying potential sites for qualified projects.				
Action Plan 2.3.1. Redevelopment tax increments will be utilized to provide for the development of infrastructure improvements to serve infill sites. As submitted by developers.	Ongoing	Firebaugh Redevelopment Agency	Redevelopment funding	The City provided Redevelopment funding to the San Joaquin Villas, and also the Soares single- and multi-family rehab project completed at the northwest corner of 8 th and P Streets.

Goal 3: Equal Access to Housing

Action Plan 3.1.1. The programs noted in the following matrix illustrate the various local agencies and their continuing involvement in activity to reduce or eliminate all types of housing discrimination. These are ongoing activities	Ongoing	City of Firebaugh	General fund and RDA funds	Firebaugh has been implementing the programs listed below successfully.
---	---------	-------------------	----------------------------	---

Policy	Agency		
	Firebaugh Community Development Department	State Fair Employment and Housing	Fresno County Department of Community Development
Encourage Fair Housing law enforcement	X	X	X
Support increased employment/economic opportunity	X	X	X

Firebaugh Housing Element 2008 – 2013
Chapter 2: Evaluation

Encourage a range of housing opportunity near employment centers	X	X	X
Full utilization of housing assistance programs	X	X	
Support housing programs maximizing choice for all	X	X	X
Minimize development policies imposing limited affordability	X	X	X
Impart housing rights and refer to State Fair Housing when necessary	X	X	X
Discourage housing discrimination	X	X	X
Support Fresno County inter-agency task force	X	X	
Continue outreach/education program regarding discrimination	X	X	X

<u>Action</u>	<u>Year</u>	<u>Agency</u>	<u>Funding</u>	<u>Evaluation</u>
Action Plan 3.1.2. In response to SB 520, the City of Firebaugh will make dwellings adaptable and accessible for disabled persons by assigning funding priority, where feasible, to housing rehabilitation cases in which accessibility improvements are planned, and where such improvements are the only ones necessary, to total 50 units in the planning period.	Ongoing	City of Firebaugh	General Fund	The City has rehabilitated three units using CDBG and HOME funds. The program was advertised with brochures, flyers and advertisements.
Action Plan 3.1.3. The Zoning Ordinance will be amended in 2006, following completion of the City's General Plan Update scheduled in 2005, to specify siting requirements for group homes consistent with state law for small group homes and with a conditional use permit for large facilities. Clearly stated requirements for approval of group homes will give greater certainty to an applicant and remove an impediment to fair housing choice for elderly, disabled or persons with special needs. The City will analyze and determine on an annual basis whether there are constraints on the development, maintenance and improvement of housing intended for persons with disabilities, consistent with Senate Bill	2006	City of Firebaugh	General Fund	This program was not completed, however no requests or applications were submitted for this type of development.

Firebaugh Housing Element 2008 – 2013
Chapter 2: Evaluation

Action	Year	Agency	Funding	Evaluation
520, in a report to City Council. The analysis will include an evaluation of existing land use controls, permit and processing procedures and building codes. If any constraints are found in these areas, the City will initiate actions within six months of the completion of the evaluation to address them, including removing the constraints or providing reasonable accommodation for housing intended for persons with disabilities.				
Action Plan 3.1.4. The Zoning Ordinance will be amended in 2006, following completion of the City's General Plan Update scheduled in 2005, to specify allowable siting requirements for homeless shelters in Commercial zones, consistent with state law for small homeless shelters and with a conditional use permit for large facilities. Clearly stated requirements for approval of homeless shelters will give greater certainty to an applicant and remove an impediment to fair housing for the homeless population.	2006	City of Firebaugh	General Fund	This program was not completed, however no requests or applications were submitted for this type of development.
Action Plan 3.1.5. Firebaugh will permit encroachments into the public rights of way that involve improvements that serve persons with a disability, including wheelchair ramps and ramp railings. This process will be handled administratively through an encroachment permit.	Ongoing	City of Firebaugh	General Fund and permit fees	The City implements this program in an on-going fashion, however no requests were made during the planning period.
Action Plan 3.1.5. Firebaugh will amend its Zoning Ordinance to permit encroachments into the front, side and rear yard setback areas for improvements that	Ongoing	City of Firebaugh	General Fund and permit fees	The Zoning Ordinance allows Minor Deviations for such encroachments.

Firebaugh Housing Element 2008 – 2013
Chapter 2: Evaluation

Action	Year	Agency	Funding	Evaluation
serve persons with a disability, including carports, garages, wheelchair ramps, ramp railings and porches. This process will be handled as a minor deviation to the Zoning Ordinance.				
Action Plan 3.2.1. In instances where households are displaced as a result of public activities, such as through redevelopment processes, the City of Firebaugh shall assist in the relocation of households in accordance with state and local laws and regulations.	Ongoing	City of Firebaugh	Redevelopment funds	No projects were conducted during the planning period that resulted in the displacement of residents.

Goal 4: Safe Housing

Action	Year	Agency	Funding	Evaluation
Action Plan 4.1.1. The City of Firebaugh will continue to enforce the Housing Code (Fresno County Ordinance Code, Chapter 15.32, Substandard Housing and Unsafe Structures), which provides minimum health and safety standards for the maintenance of the existing housing supply.	Ongoing	City of Firebaugh	General Fund and permit fees	This program continues to be implemented by the Firebaugh Building Department and the Code Enforcement officer.
Action Plan 4.1.2. The Environmental Health System will continue to enforce the State’s Employee Housing Act regarding health and safety standards relating to employer-owned labor camps that provide living quarters for five or more employees.	Ongoing	City of Firebaugh	General Fund and permit fees	This program continues to be implemented.
Action Plan 4.1.3. Promote the alleviation of overcrowded housing conditions by assigning funding priority, where feasible, to rehabilitate units where safety issues are involved.	Ongoing	City of Firebaugh	Redevelopment funds	The City assisted two households under this program.
Action Plan 4.1.4. Continue development agreement	Ongoing	City of Firebaugh	General and Redevelopment	The City provided “gap” funding from

Firebaugh Housing Element 2008 – 2013
Chapter 2: Evaluation

<u>Action</u>	<u>Year</u>	<u>Agency</u>	<u>Funding</u>	<u>Evaluation</u>
activity to initiate new housing construction that includes affordable housing units by providing incentives such as expedited permit processing, “gap”, or other financing in support of such development.			nt funds	the Firebaugh Redevelopment Agency to assist the San Joaquin Villas project – a 21 unit affordable condominium project, approved in 2006.
Action Plan 4.1.5. Review Property Maintenance Ordinance and improve process as feasible and legal to address “nuisance” property concerns without unnecessary cost to the City for enforcement.	December 2004.	City of Firebaugh	General and Redevelopment funds	Completed

Goal 5: Long Term Integrity and Value of Housing

<u>Action</u>	<u>Year</u>	<u>Agency</u>	<u>Funding</u>	<u>Evaluation</u>
Action Plan 5.1.1. Participate in the Fresno County Housing Assistance Rehabilitation Program (HARP) administered by the Department of Community Development by actively implementing outreach efforts to advise City residents of program availability.	Ongoing	City of Firebaugh, Fresno County	CDBG	The City provides its own housing rehabilitation program using CDBG funds and redevelopment funding.
Action Plan 5.1.2. Similar to Program 1.1.1, Firebaugh will support non-profit housing, and housing services providers through actions necessary to expedite approval processing of rehabilitation projects including, but not limited to, Housing Authority Section 8 and the HUD Rental Rehabilitation program. As applications are received.	Ongoing	City of Firebaugh	General Fund	The City has provided assistance to the Greenlining Foundation for construction of a 21-unit affordable condominium project. The project was approved on February 5, 2007 and is expected to begin construction shortly. The City also participated with the Relational Cultural Institute to ascertain housing needs and issues in the Del Rio

Firebaugh Housing Element 2008 – 2013
Chapter 2: Evaluation

Action	Year	Agency	Funding	Evaluation
				neighborhood of Firebaugh.
Action Plan 5.1.3. Create a Down payment Assistance Program (DAP) for moderate and low-income persons to purchase new or resale homes within or adjacent to the Redevelopment Project Area. Provide assistance grants with deed restrictions for at least 10 years.				The City operates its down payment assistance program utilizing redevelopment and HOME funding. Three households were assisted with this program during the planning period.
Action Plan 5.1.4. Cooperate with the Fresno County Homeowners Workshops of public information, and technical assistance to encourage continued maintenance of currently sound housing..	Ongoing	City of Firebaugh	General Fund	The City partnered with the Relational Cultural Institute to conduct a first time home buyers workshop in 2006.
Action Plan 5.1.5. Inspect all housing units being constructed, rehabilitated, expanded or relocated to enforce the Uniform Building Code and related sub-codes. On-going.	Ongoing	City of Firebaugh, Building Department	General Fund and permit fees	The City has successfully implemented this plan on an on-going basis.
Action Plan 5.1.6. Conserve neighborhoods through community cleanup. This program consists of the periodic designation of a day or weekend as “neighborhood clean-up/fix-up day.” The City will cooperate with various neighborhood groups, civic organizations and others willing to assist in helping those (especially the elderly and disabled) who might be unable to perform minor maintenance tasks.	Ongoing – once per year.	City of Firebaugh, Public Works Department	General Fund	The City has successfully implemented this plan, typically conducting one clean up day per year.

Goal 6: Affordable Housing

<u>Action</u>	<u>Year</u>	<u>Agency</u>	<u>Funding</u>	<u>Evaluation</u>
Action Plan 6.1.1. Continue to encourage affordable housing developer applications for such programs as Farmers Home Administration 502 (Interest Subsidy), and 515 (Rental Housing Construction), Section 8 Rental Housing Section 8 Mortgage Payment Program, California Housing Finance Agency AB333 (CHFA), and others.	Ongoing	City of Firebaugh	General Fund	There have been no projects proposed in Firebaugh during the planning period that proposed utilizing the subject funding sources. However, the City does have a number of Section 8 units, and Section 8 card holding households.
Action Plan 6.1.2. Take all necessary actions to expedite processing and approvals for such projects.	Ongoing	City of Firebaugh	General fund and permit fees	The City expedited processing for the San Joaquin Villas project – an affordable 21-unit condominium development.
Action Plan 6.2.1. Firebaugh will continue to implement the density bonus of at least 25 percent, and additional incentive, or financially equivalent incentive(s), to a development agreeing to construct at least: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Twenty percent of the units for lower income households; or 2. Ten percent of the units for lower households; or 3. Fifty percent of the units for senior citizens. 	Ongoing – as applications are submitted	City of Firebaugh	General fund and permit fees	No projects requested a density bonus during the planning period.
Action Plan 6.2.2. Utilize a portion of its Community Development Block Grant allocation and/or tax increment to write down infrastructure improvements necessary to the development or affordability of housing. Tax increment, and perhaps some CDBG, will be used for the density bonus program.	As development applications are received.	City of Firebaugh and Firebaugh Redevelopment Agency	CDBG and Redevelopment set-aside funds	No projects requested a density bonus during the planning period.

Firebaugh Housing Element 2008 – 2013
Chapter 2: Evaluation

<u>Action</u>	<u>Year</u>	<u>Agency</u>	<u>Funding</u>	<u>Evaluation</u>
Action Plan 6.2.3. The City shall expand the availability of housing units suited to the needs of large and/or extended families, the elderly, disabled, homeless, and others through financial assistance in new construction of at least 20 units by July 2006.	By 2006	City of Firebaugh	Redevelopment funding	No projects were submitted which the City could assist with.

Goal 7: Adequate Regional Housing

<u>Action</u>	<u>Year</u>	<u>Agency</u>	<u>Funding</u>	<u>Evaluation</u>
Action Plan 7.1.1. Continually review development fees to determine whether or not they constitute constraints on development and or improvement of housing.	Ongoing	City of Firebaugh	General Fund	A review and update of development fees was completed in 2006.
Action Plan 7.1.2. Review, at least annually, potential barriers to “infill” development and formulate incentives, to assist development of by-passed parcels including identified land sites under 10,000 square feet.	No date specified	City of Firebaugh	General Fund	The City has provided gap funding to assist the Greenlining Foundation in the development of its 21-unit affordable condominium project on an infill site on Highway 33, north of Clyde Fannon Road. Further, the 2030 General Plan includes analysis and policies reducing impact fees for infill projects.

Goal 8: Adequate Natural Resources

<u>Action</u>	<u>Year</u>	<u>Agency</u>	<u>Funding</u>	<u>Evaluation</u>
Action Plan 8.1.1. Manage new residential development within the context of a planning framework designed to minimize adverse impacts	Ongoing – as projects are proposed	City of Firebaugh	General Fund and project funding	The City has required shade trees along residential streets in the most recent subdivision

Firebaugh Housing Element 2008 – 2013
Chapter 2: Evaluation

Action	Year	Agency	Funding	Evaluation
<p>on the area’s natural resource base and overall living environment. For example, encourage the use of passive housing design concepts that make use of the natural climate to increase energy efficiency and reduce shelter costs.</p>				<p>(Valle Del Sol) – to help reduce heating, and thereby reducing cooling costs. Street standards are being revised in the current General Plan update to require shade trees along all future streets. In addition, a standard is included in the General Plan requiring solar orientation of future subdivisions.</p>
<p>Action Plan 8.1.2. Include information on utility company(s) energy saving program and weatherization programs of non-profit organizations in a brochure developed and distributed by City Planning and Code Enforcement.</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>	<p>City of Firebaugh</p>	<p>General Fund</p>	<p>The Firebaugh Building Department maintains informational handouts on energy-saving programs.</p>